



Kilimo Endelevu Arusha: Program for sustainable land management and agroecological transition in the Arusha region of Tanzania

External evaluation

TERMS OF REFERENCES

Technical and financial proposals must be submitted no later than 17 March 2024 by e-mail to Ms. Manon Albagnac, CARI: sahel@cariassociation.org

Table of Contents

1. The project and involved stakeholders.	2
1.1. Presentation of the demanding organization (CARI)	2
1.2. Presentation of the co-demanding organization	3
1.3. Presentation of the partners.....	3
1.4. Description of the project	4
1.5. Partnership and institutional set-up	9
1.6. Monitoring and evaluation system	12
1.7. Budget.....	12
2. The external evaluation	13
2.1. Rationale of the evaluation.....	13
2.2. Purpose of the evaluation.....	13
2.3. Expected methodology.....	17
3. Consultant recruitment	19
3.1. Requirements.....	19
3.2. Agenda for the evaluation	20
3.3. Technical and methodological proposal	20
3.4. Selection criteria	20
4. Appendix	21

January 2024



Frequently used acronyms

ACAF: Arusha Collaborators' Forum for Agroecology

AFD: *Agence Française de Développement* (translated as French Development Agency)

CARI: *Centre d'Actions et de Réalisations Internationales* (translated as Centre for International Actions and Achievements) – French NGO

DGD: Directorate-General for Development Cooperation and Humanitarian Aid – Belgium

IDP: *Iles de Paix* (translated as Islands of Peace) – Belgian NGO

MVIWAARUSHA: Mtandao wa Vikundi vya Wakulima wa Mkoa wa Arusha – Tanzanian Farmers' organization

NGO: Non-Governmental Organization

RECODA: Research, Community and Organizational Development Associates – Tanzanian NGO

RIPAT: Rural Initiative for Participatory Agricultural Transformation

1. The project and involved stakeholders.

1.1. Presentation of the demanding organization (CARI)

1.1.1. *Objectives of the organization*

The *Centre d'Actions et de Réalisations Internationales* – CARI – is a non-governmental organization (NGO) that has been working since 1998 to improve the way of life of rural populations living in drylands, particularly in the Maghreb and the Sahel.

CARI's actions are centered on combating desertification and promoting the sustainable management of natural resources. CARI therefore works to promote a sustainable rural development, relying on the principles and approaches of agroecology.

CARI achieves its objectives by implementing field projects and by setting up and facilitating networks of stakeholders. CARI believes that it is important for civil societies to come together in networks: if they are better organized and structured, local organizations will carry more weight with decision-makers and play a direct role in improving the actions of civil society. To this end, CARI's actions in the field and its advocacy work are carried out in part through the civil society networks that it leads: GTD (French platform), ReSaD (network of platforms in Burkina Faso, France, Mali and Niger), RADDO (network of associations in Algeria, Morocco, Mauritania, Niger, Chad and Tunisia).

1.1.2. *Institutional set-up*

CARI is an association under the law of 1901 (France), made up of a board of administrators and a permanent team of employees.

The team of employees is composed of:

- A management team (a Managing Director and a Programs Director)
- A project unit (four thematic project officers)
- And a transversal unit (an administrative and financial manager and a communications officer).

CARI's total annual budget for 2022: 1,336,979 Euros.



1.1.3. Experience in the relevant field

For 20 years, CARI has built its expertise on the themes of combating desertification, sustainable land management and agroecology, and on the practices of supporting civil society organizations, strengthening local authorities, supporting territorial development and structuring of advocacy. Throughout its involvement in regional projects in the Maghreb and the Sahel with the RADDO and ReSaD networks, CARI has built a certain number of tools and practices with its partners. For example, CARI coordinated the construction of a module to train and support authorities in designing sustainable land management projects. The module enables elected officials and local authorities to be equipped for facilitating participatory consultation and implementing local development plans. This tool, tested and implemented in French-speaking Sahelian countries, has been widely acclaimed by communities and the organizations that support them. IUCN has also asked CARI to disseminate this tool in the English-speaking Sahelian countries, by allowing the translation of the supports of the training module and the sensitization of local organizations in 4 English-speaking countries.

1.2. Presentation of the co-demanding organization

Iles de Paix – IDP – is a Belgian non-governmental organization, created in the 1960s, whose interventions aim to enable populations to pursue their own sustainable development process independently and with dignity. IDP promotes food systems that are sustainable, inclusive, healthy and resilient to climate change:

- Food production, marketing and consumption systems that guarantee the right to food for all.
- Food systems that don't compromise the economic, social and environmental foundations necessary for food and nutritional security for future generations.

To this end, IDP supports farmers in agricultural diversification (crops, livestock and trees), farmer seed systems, conservation agriculture and access to irrigation. It also supports the implementation of efficient and affordable techniques and technologies for post-harvest management, including storage, and small businesses in the development of local, fair and profitable marketing channels. Finally, it promotes an environment favorable to the development of sustainable family farming and responsible food.

IDP has been present and recognized as an NGO in Tanzania since 2015. It benefits from numerous and close relations with local, regional, and national authorities but also with national and international civil society organizations. IDP is part of Tanzanian networks promoting sustainable agriculture, including Tanzania Organic Agriculture Movement (TOAM), Tanzanian Alliance for Biodiversity (TABIO) and Participatory Ecological Land Use Management (PELUM) and IDP is an active member of the platform "Arusha Sustainable Food Systems" to which it contributes by creating links and sharing knowledge on agroecology.

1.3. Presentation of the partners

RECODA is a Tanzanian NGO created in 2000 with the aim of bridging the technological gap in agricultural development. RECODA aims to eradicate poverty and food insecurity in Tanzania by ensuring that rural communities are able to generate socially and economically sustainable livelihoods that allow them to improve their living conditions. RECODA is a reference NGO, recognized at national level, for rural development in Tanzania. It is an active member of several networks at regional and national level (PELUM, TOAM). For 20 years, RECODA's interventions have focused on supporting small family farms in their production activities (conservation



agriculture, agricultural diversification), storage, processing and marketing of agricultural products. The NGO benefits of a knowledge of the physical, socio-economic and agricultural environment, particularly in northern Tanzania, where the Arusha region is located. RECODA has capitalized on its experience and expertise, through the RIPAT approach (Rural Initiative for Participatory Agricultural Transformation). RIPAT is an agricultural extension approach for dissemination of practices and support to farmers. It enables to address the challenges faced by small-scale farmers with sustainable and inexpensive solutions. It provides them with appropriate tools, techniques, and information, relying on participation and self-help assistance. RIPAT inspires farmers to have a development vision freed from the syndrome of donor dependency and to join groups where various 'baskets of technology options' are introduced, leaving each farmer with a real opportunity to choose which technologies to adopt, when and to what extent, according to their needs and resources.

Mtandao wa Vikundi vya Wakulima Mkoa wa Arusha, abbreviated MVIWAARUSHA, is a regional farmers' organization created in 2010 from the first federations of producers in several districts of Arusha. The organization specifically brings together small-scale farmers (livestock keepers, farmers, beekeepers, and fishermen) of the six districts of the region. Today it has 9,029 members (including 5,417 women) organized in groups in villages and at district level. The main objective of MVIWAARUSHA is to strengthen groups of farmers and pastoralists to improve their participation in the planning, implementation, and supervision of social and economic development processes. MVIWAARUSHA has set up a technical unit of 18 employees whose areas of expertise are: community development, agricultural extension, and livestock-breeding. With its projects, MVIWAARUSHA aims at the economic development of small-scale farmers, by supporting the production, processing, and marketing of agricultural products. To this end, it collaborates with non-governmental actors (such as IDP, TRIAS and BOS +), and has established a close partnership with the district authorities. MVIWAARUSHA also supports its members to strengthen their voices on issues that concern them through lobbying and advocacy. It enjoys growing recognition, from local to national level, as the voice of farmers and herders in the public and political arenas. MVIWAARUSHA is a member of several networks at the national level including Tanzania Gender Networking Program (TGNP), Agriculture Non-State Actors Forum (ANSAF), TOAM and TABIO.

1.4. Description of the project

1.4.1. *Project implementation schedule*

The Kilimo Endelevu Arusha / ARUTAE project is **the 1st phase (3 years) of a 9-years program** aiming to contribute to the resilience of the populations of the Arusha region in Tanzania in the face of climatic and environmental disruptions, through support for family farms to ensure their sustainability and their increased contribution to the food and nutritional sovereignty of the territory. This first phase is co-funded by the French Development Agency (AFD).

Inception date: February 1st, 2022

Ending date: January 31st, 2025

As detailed further in the document, the implementation of Kilimo Endelevu Arusha combines two projects, linked to two main donors (AFD and DGD) that concur to the same general objective of supporting agroecological transition and sustainable land management towards sustainable food systems in the Arusha Region.



1.4.2. Project location

The project is implemented in Tanzania, focusing on the Arusha region in the north of the country. More specifically, the project targets the District of Arusha-Rural, which has an estimated population of 323,200 inhabitants (National Census – 2012) and covers an area of 1,500 km². In this "pilot" area, the partners will set up a process to develop sustainable food systems by supporting small scale-farmers in 10 villages of the district, assisting the district authorities in their role as pilots for the development of their territory, as well as consultation, advocacy and awareness-raising activities involving the citizens of the Arusha region.

1.4.3. Context

Although the population is predominantly rural, food insecurity is a major concern in the Arusha region. It is linked to the degradation of natural resources, the poor skills of the small-scale farmers, and the lack of action by the government to develop a sustainable agriculture that respects the environment and is directed towards food sovereignty. Rural households, particularly women, are the most vulnerable to these challenges.

Small-scale farmers have little knowledge and skills on the sustainable production techniques that would enable them to improve their productivity while preserving resources. They also face difficulties in marketing quality products that would enable them to generate a regular income.

For their part, the local authorities in the Arusha region are not very aware of the issues or equipped to support resilient food systems based on the sustainable use of natural resources and the work of family farms. Finally, both rural and urban populations have little understanding of the links between agriculture, food and health.

- ➔ This diagnosis highlights the difficulties in terms of agricultural development of the territories due to internal factors (production practices, storage, marketing) and external (climate change, low awareness, inadequate public policies).

1.4.4. Objectives

The diagnosis, discussed by the project partners, led to develop the general objective: **contributing to the resilience of the populations of the Arusha region through support for sustainable, territorialized food systems.**

This objective reflects a long-term vision of professionalized farmers capable of feeding themselves and urban populations with high-quality products, making the most of the natural resources of the Arusha region without compromising their renewal. Against a backdrop of climate change, environmental degradation and global economic and health crises, the resilience of populations depends on access to subsistence means, jobs and economic income generated sustainably in the region, through the agriculture and food sectors.

- ➔ By planning a 9-year intervention, the partners aim to gradually remove the obstacles and weaknesses identified. The first phase of the project concerns family farms in the Arusha region, but also their environmental, social, and political environment.

CARI and its partners have two specific objectives:

- (1) Small scale farmers in the Arusha region improve their food and nutritional security, as well as their economic viability, through sustainable land management and agroecological intensification.

The project will act on the internal constraints of farms, namely their shortcomings in terms of mastery of techniques and technologies, access to means of production, and access to



information enabling decision-making, so that they improve their production systems and business management.

- (2) The institutional and social environment of the Arusha region facilitates the deployment of sustainable land management and agroecological intensification.

The project will act on constraints external to farms, namely the lack of involvement of actors in the region and the national territory in supporting food systems based on local productions that preserve natural resources.

1.4.5. Beneficiaries

Direct beneficiaries targeted by the project:

- **1,500 small-scale farmers** in the District of Arusha Rural, among which the partners want to reach 50% women and 20% young people (under 35). 600 farmers will benefit from intensive support from the project.
- **115 representatives of local authorities** (elected officials and extension officers) of the ten implementation villages and the District of Arusha Rural.
- **Representatives of the 17 member organizations of the regional platform “Arusha Sustainable Food Systems”** (NGOs, Tanzanian public institutions and local authorities).
- **24 people responsible for 12 farmers organizations active at national level** trained and supported for the construction and implementation of a common advocacy strategy.

Considering gender in targeting beneficiaries

The project has supported the constitution of producer groups in each village, with requirements to respect gender parity in their constitution and include at least one third of women in leadership positions.

The 21 groups constituted are composed of 690 farmers, including 492 women (71%).

Number of indirect beneficiaries targeted by the project:

- **Population of the 10 implementation villages** estimated at **30,000 people**, whose **2,700 family members** of the 600 farmers benefiting from intensive support from the project (average household size in the Arusha Rural District: 4.5 people).
- **26,247 members** of the 12 farmer organizations active at the national level whose leaders have been trained in advocacy.

1.4.6. Main activities and results

Expected Result 1.1: 600 family farms have initiated the transformation of their production systems towards more performance and sustainability.

- Diagnosis activities

At the start of the project, the partners carried out many missions in the villages to inform the authorities and the local population about the project and to collect data for the diagnosis. The village consultations enabled farmers to express their expectations regarding the project's areas of intervention and the techniques to be transferred.

This diagnostic phase also enabled the partners to identify some of the challenges facing the project area, in particular the limited availability of land for small-scale farmers and the difficulties in accessing water for irrigation.



- Setting up and supporting learning groups

The time spent in the villages at the start of the project was also used to set up farmers' groups which will benefit from the project. The 21 farmers' groups provide a forum for learning, for disseminating what has been learnt between peers and for sharing the means of production provided by the project. These groups are self-organized and identify members who will attend training courses organized by the project. The farmers must then share the knowledge they have acquired with the other members. They also redistribute the inputs supplied by the project (seeds, seedlings). The project team monitor the operation of these groups and provide regular training in group management.

- Training farmers and supplying inputs and production equipment

Support for agroecological intensification is based on capacity-building plans for farmers drawn up based on the baskets of options identified during the diagnosis phase and broken down by village. These baskets of options concern agricultural techniques, the integration of new crops (arboriculture in particular) and the introduction of livestock units.

The technical training activities take place on demonstration plots made available to each group by farmers or village chiefs. To promote livestock breeding activities, buildings have been set up on the premises of volunteer farmers. These are demonstration areas for the benefit of all group members. Finally, the project has made it possible to work closely with agricultural extension officers, by including them in the training courses.

- Land restoration

The land restoration strategy is based on training farmers within the groups in several land restoration techniques. These farmers have been provided with equipment (levels, ropes, etc.) and are responsible for identifying and supporting farmers in the groups who wish to carry out erosion control measures on their plots. At the same time, several reforestation campaigns have been carried out with the support of the project in communal areas (schools, etc.). Planting has been done to stabilize the land around major erosion ditches.

Expected result 1.2: Family farms have improved and secured their integration into the agri-food sectors throughout the year.

- Support for post-harvest management

The project has enabled groups of farmers to begin training in improved storage techniques for maize and beans. The use of watertight containers and bags prevents the development of insect pests and does not require the application of pesticides. Storage tests have been set up to enable farmers to compare the performance of these techniques.

- Marketing support activities

Activities to support the marketing of products (fruits and vegetables) have been initiated with three groups in one of the project villages. The members of the groups were trained to set up participatory guarantee systems, which enable local products to be certified based on the active participation of stakeholders and the establishment of a network of trust and knowledge-sharing. The farmers were put in touch with fruit and vegetable sellers from various outlets in the town of Arusha. They also took part in a farmers' market in the town of Arusha.



Expected result 2.1: A structured and active dynamic of multi-stakeholder dialogue on healthy food, a sustainable environment and an organized territory is established.

- Facilitation of local consultation at village level

Local consultation at village level was initiated at the start of the project, through the diagnosis activities, which consulted village assemblies and local authorities on several occasions. Nevertheless, the concept of territorial development being new to the project partners in Tanzania, they expressed expectations of CARI in terms of understanding the proposed approach and receiving methodological support. CARI and the partners therefore decided to establish a strategy for the deployment of a territorial approach, integrating capacity building for the partners, the implementation of a pilot action on the scale of one village, and then the extension to other villages. CARI drew on learning from its previous work and that of its partners to establish the training content and propose a framework for a territorial approach within the project. At the end of the training sessions, the partners drew up a roadmap and launched a pilot project to facilitate multi-stakeholder consultation on a sustainable food system for the village of Losikito.

- Engaging with the local authorities

Informing and involving the representatives of the local governments (village, district, and regional levels) proved to be an essential prerequisite for starting up and implementing the project. The partners have noted that the extension officers and elected representatives are becoming increasingly involved in the project's activities, and they see it as in their interest to strengthen their skills.

The project has made it possible to start exploring several possibilities of collaboration with local authorities in the project area, on issues linked to food systems: access to water in rural areas, organic waste management, etc. Several discussion meetings and an awareness-raising workshop on waste management were organized.

- Contribution to multi-stakeholder platforms at regional level

Partners of the project contribute to two platforms:

The Arusha Food Systems Platform, which aims to create complementarities and synergies between stakeholders' interventions and to advocate for an enabling environment for food systems by establishing evidence of impact at regional, national, and global levels. This platform has proved to be an effective framework for building synergies between the project and the actions of other development players. Collaboration is underway on consumer awareness-raising activities, as well as on market access for local produce.

The Arusha Collaborators' Forum for Agroecology (ACAF), which brings together interested and willing individuals, organizations, institutions, and media networks to share their knowledge, experiences, best practices, and challenges in the field of agroecology. ACAF meetings provide a framework for sharing experiences and strengthening the players involved. The first meeting, for example, helped to build a common understanding of sustainable agriculture (agroecology, agroforestry, conservation agriculture, etc.). Until then, these concepts had not been widely taken on board or discussed by agricultural development stakeholders.



Expected result 2.2: Citizens and organized civil society mobilize in favor of agroecology and healthy eating.

- Awareness-raising activities:

Sensitization actions targeting the downstream end of the food system have mobilized a variety of tools and channels and have been designed in synergy with several organizations working in the region to promote sustainable food systems (RIKOLTO, GAIN, Farm Radio International).

These actions targeted:

- Journalists through training on the issues covered by the project.
- Vendors and consumers at markets in the town of Arusha, with a poster campaign on good hygiene practices.
- Schoolchildren in the project villages, who were involved in reforestation activities and made aware of the need to protect the environment.

- Influencing public policy:

Finally, the project is contributing to the emergence and accelerated deployment of the SHIWAKUTA network (officially recognized in 2021). This network, whose secretariat is provided by MVIWAARUSHA, represents the first structured federation of farmers' organizations on a national scale. Although agroecology is still a new subject in Tanzania, the project has enabled it to be immediately placed at the heart of SHIWAKUTA's discussions.

The project enabled network members to work together to prepare initial advocacy messages and position papers. These positions are presented to political decision-makers at events and bilateral meetings.

1.5. Partnership and institutional set-up

The Kilimo Endelevu Arusha project is a combination of two projects, linked to two main donors (AFD and DGD) that concur to the same general objective of supporting agroecological transition and sustainable land management towards sustainable food systems in the Arusha Region.

It has been decided, for the sake of consistency, efficiency, and effectiveness, to merge these two projects and form only one program.



The two projects differ by the period of implementation, the organization of the objectives and results, as shown in the table below:

Donor	AFD (French Development Agency)	DGD (Belgian cooperation for development)
Implementation period	February 2022 – January 2025	January 2022 – December 2026
Partnership setup	Project coordinated by CARI and implemented with IDP, RECODA and MVIWAARUSHA as partners	Project coordinated by IDP and implemented with CARI, RECODA and MVIWAARUSHA as partners
General Objective	Contribute to the resilience of the populations of the Arusha region, in the North of Tanzania, through support for sustainable and territorialized food systems	Farmers and other social economy actors, with special focus on youth and women, enjoy improved living conditions, through co-construction, with citizens in North and South, of sustainable and resilient food systems and a healthy environment.
Specific Objective	SO 1 - Family farms in the Arusha region are improving their food and nutrition security, as well as their economic viability, through sustainable land management and agroecological intensification SO 2 - The institutional and social environment of the Arusha region facilitates the deployment of sustainable land management and agroecological intensification	The commitment of the program's target actors in favor of the co-construction of a Sustainable Food System and a healthy environment is strengthened.
Result 1	600 family farms have initiated the transformation of their production systems towards greater performance and sustainability	Farmers and other actors of the social economy supported by the program are engaged in agroecological production methods and sustainable management of the environment
Result 2	Family farms have improved and secured their integration into the agri-food sectors throughout the year	Farmers and other actors of the social economy supported by the program have established and/or strengthened fair and sustainable collection, storage, processing and marketing systems
Result 3	A structured and active dynamic of multi-actor dialogue on healthy food, a sustainable environment and an organized territory is established	At local level, public actors and actors representing farmers and other actors of the sustainable economy have set up inclusive territorial development dynamics supporting the co-construction of sustainable food systems and sustainable environmental management
Result 4	Citizens and organized civil society are mobilizing in favor of agroecology and healthy food	National and international public policies realizing the rights of farmers and other actors of the social economy have been discussed, adopted and implemented
Result 5		The citizens reached by the program are sensitized, engaged and mobilized for the development of SFS and a healthy environment.
Result 6		Women participate more in the different levels of management of the SFS and of the environment

NB: This external evaluation constitutes the final evaluation of the AFD project, and the mid-term evaluation of the DGD project.

The results from this external evaluation will be mobilized to prepare the next phases of both projects.





Coordination of the project is ensured by the CARI which is responsible for the administrative, financial, and operational management of the project with regard to AFD. As such, CARI performs the following tasks:

- Manage the funds allocated to the project by AFD.
- Ensures the mobilization of co-financing for the project.
- Is responsible for the coherence of the partnership and the implementation of the project: development and monitoring of general planning in consultation with the partners.
- Organizes and leads the meetings of the project steering committee made up of representatives of the four partners.
- Compiles the narrative and financial reports of the partners and is responsible for the overall narrative and financial reporting (intermediate and final) given to the donor.
- Ensures the institutional representation of the project in France and internationally (including the framework of the UNCCD)

The strategic responsibility for the project is ensured by a steering committee which as met twice a year. This steering committee is composed of:

- CARI: program director and project manager
- IDP: Country Director and Program Manager
- RECODA: director or deputy director and program manager
- MVIWAARUSHA: coordinator and program Officer

Within the steering committee, the partners discuss and takes decisions concerning the project, the intervention strategy and the short- and medium-term partnership. The steering committee meetings allow to: (i) monitor the implementation of the general planning of the project according to the objectives, (ii) identify the problems or blocking points and propose / validate solutions, (iii) prepare the following project phases, (iv) refine the overall partnership strategy of the project.

The methodological and technical responsibility of the project is ensured by the technical committee made up of projects managers from CARI, IDP, MVIWAARUSHA and RECODA. They meet every month by videoconference (and as often as necessary). This committee will be responsible for validating the content of the activities proposed by the operational team and for mobilizing the technical and methodological expertise necessary for the quality of the project. With regards to the technical responsibility, IDP is in charge of overseeing the implementation of the project in Tanzania, and as such performs the following specific tasks:

- Manage financial flows with Tanzanian partners and control financial reports before transmission to CARI and IDP headquarters.
- Supervises the Tanzanian partners in the development and monitoring of the periodic planning of the project.
- Supervises the implementation of activities and daily relations with Tanzanian partners.
- Ensures the mobilization of co-financing for the project (DGD).

Operational responsibility for the implementation of activities in Tanzania is entrusted to the MVIWAARUSHA and RECODA teams. They ensure the preparation, organization, and implementation of activities, with methodological support from CARI and IDP, following the guidelines provided by the technical committee. This operational team reports monthly to the technical committee, providing a narrative and financial report according to a common framework.

As such, MVIWAARUSHA and RECODA assume the following tasks:

- Prepare and implement activities following the general and periodic planning of the project.
- Develop the deliverables and narrative and financial activity reports.
- Ensure the participation of beneficiaries and their representation within the project.
- Ensure the collection of data to feed the internal monitoring and evaluation system.

1.6. Monitoring and evaluation system

The project's expected performance are assessed using a monitoring-evaluation matrix that includes i) changes in objectively verifiable indicators (OVIs) for each activity and ii) progress markers that reflect changes in results, specific objectives, and the general objective. This matrix incorporates indicators defined in the Agroecology Performance Assessment Tool (TAPE) developed by the FAO¹. The TAPE tool is used to diagnose production systems and provide concrete data on the performance of agroecological systems in terms of environmental, social, and cultural, economic, health and nutritional aspects, as well as governance.

An initial data collection exercise was carried out in November 2022, with beneficiary farmers, to establish the baseline situation for monitoring and evaluation. Data will be collected again in November 2024, to fill in the indicators and check the progress made by the project.

1.7. Budget

Global budget of the project: 1,197,955 euros

Funding scheme: AFD (41%), Belgian Cooperation (41%), MIROVA foundation (13%), Occitanie Region (5%).

¹ <https://www.fao.org/agroecology/tools-tape/en/>



2. The external evaluation

2.1. Rationale of the evaluation

2.1.1. *Origin of the demand*

CARI, IDP, RECODA and MVIWAARUSHA are the initiators of this request for an external evaluation in accordance with the requirements of the agreement with both donors (AFD and DGD).

2.1.2. *Partners' expectations*

The four partner organizations have several expectations of this external evaluation:

Learning:

They would like the evaluation to enable it to learn from their practices in the different themes of the project. The partners also want the evaluation to enable them to measure the progress made during the first phase of the project.

Accountability:

At the end of the first phase of the AFD programming, and halfway through the DGD programming they would like to understand the results of their commitments and investments, with a view to report to their donors.

Promotion:

In order to assert their position in the institutional scene, the partners would like the evaluation to question the relevance and effects of their joint action to contribute to the transformation of the Arusha food system.

Decision-making support:

Lastly, the partners expect the evaluation to provide information to help them develop the future phases of the project.

2.2. Purpose of the evaluation

2.2.1. *Scope of the evaluation*

The external evaluation will concern **the first phase of the AFD programming and the first half of the DGD programming** to the Kilimo Endelevu Arusha project, from February 2022 to January 2025.

It thus relates to the activities, results and objectives of the logical framework included in the AFD project document. These activities being implemented in the Arusha region by CARI, IDP, MVIWAARUSHA and RECODA.

The evaluation will also examine **the partnership between the 4 partners**, the complementarity they are seeking, and their organizational set-up.



2.2.2. Assessment questions asked by the partners

- (1) Does the project's strategy, based on agroecology and sustainable land management, engages **family farms on a pathway toward resilience** in the face of drought?
- The partners would like to know whether the project has helped to diversify production and marketing channels for agricultural products.
 - Does the combination of agroecological intensification and land restoration approaches preserve and renew soil functions as a productive resource?
 - The external evaluation should document any visible improvement in understanding and practicing agroecology and land management in the implementation area.
 - In addition, the partners would like to know whether their strategy is relevant to improving sustainable access to necessary resources, in particular water, for small-scale farmers (with attention to gender balance).
 - The external evaluation will question the relevance of the methodology centered on farmers' decision-making and responsibility (including the inclusion of women in decision-making processes), as well as its prospects for scaling up.

Justification of these assessment questions:

The Arusha region is marked by unstable rainy seasons, as seen during the project implementation period (several episodes of drought characterized by lower, irregular and geographically uneven rainfall). This situation is exacerbated by the degradation of natural resources (forest cover, natural grasslands) and land (erosion, loss of soil fertility). These conditions threaten the long-term survival of small-scale farms.

In this context, the partners aim to strengthen **the resilience of farms** by adapting the configuration of their production systems and technical itineraries, and by improving their sustainable access to resources and means of production.

Thus, the implementation strategy deployed since 2022 focuses on:

- The renewal and sustainable management of productive resources through the dissemination of soil management practices to halt erosion and fertility maintenance techniques (compost, crop associations),
- Sustainable access to resources and means of production (rainwater storage, collective nurseries),
- Expanding sources of income (with a particular attention on women), by diversifying production (market gardening, arboriculture, livestock breeding) and marketing channels, as well as improving storage conditions.

The support and capacity-building provided to farmers is based on the RIPAT approach developed by RECODA, which places groups of farmers (men and women) at the heart of the decision-making process regarding the products and techniques to be tested. In each village, depending on the challenges they face, farmers have chosen baskets of options on which the project then provides them with training and equipment. Lastly, the project relies on farmers who are technical leaders within the groups, and who are responsible for passing on the knowledge and skills they have acquired to other group members.



- (2) Does the project's strategy contribute to the creation of a context conducive to the deployment of a sustainable food system on a regional scale?
- The partners would like to know whether this first phase of the project has achieved its objectives in terms of improving decision-makers' awareness of the issues linked to the environment-agriculture-food nexus.
 - They expect the external evaluation to show whether the intervention strategy targeting stakeholders in the Arusha region, in particular local authorities, is relevant and sustainable, and to identify limitations and recommendations regarding this intervention strategy.
 - The evaluation should also show if the partners have appropriated the approach and content transmitted by CARI in terms of territorial approaches and community strengthening (including gender issues).
 - Finally, the external evaluation should document the extent to which, at the end of this first phase, the partners are able to reinforce the action and make a significant contribution to the establishment of a social and institutional framework conducive to a transition towards a sustainable food system in the Arusha region.

Justification of these assessment questions:

To enable the transformation of the food system towards greater sustainability, the project's approach also focuses on **mobilizing and influencing decision-makers** in order to create a favorable social and institutional context.

In Tanzania, the agricultural policy framework is still inspired by the Green Revolution and does little to support sustainable family farming based on the principles of agroecology. Decentralization processes have led to the structuring of various levels of local government (villages, wards, districts, regions), which have a role to play in agricultural development, environmental preservation, and the organization of food systems. However, local decision-makers and extension services remain poorly trained in the interplay between agriculture, the environment and food.

The partners have therefore proposed an approach aimed at mobilizing the various stakeholders - including local decision-makers – of the territory around the challenges facing the food system. This approach is based on CARI's previous experience in supporting and strengthening local authorities. The approach is applied at village level, facilitating consultation between stakeholders and involving leaders in project activities. Secondly, at regional level, by raising awareness among public stakeholders (elected representatives and technical services at ward, district and regional level) of the multiple challenges of food systems (natural resources, production, nutrition, waste management, etc.), and by contributing to multi-stakeholder platforms (ACAF and Arusha Sustainable Food System Platform). In subsequent phases of the program, the partners intend to invest more in **building the capacity of local public authorities** to play their part in promoting a sustainable food system.

- (3) Does the project's strategy, which focuses on improving the marketing of agricultural products and raising awareness of healthy, sustainable eating, effectively contribute to increasing the consumption of healthy products from local family farming?
- The partners would like to know whether their actions in support of the agroecological transition are already having a positive effect on the diets of farmers' families.
 - They expect the external evaluation to show whether awareness-raising strategies are already reaching urban population and improving their level of information about food from sustainable agriculture.
 - The partners would like to assess the impact of these actions (support for the marketing and consumption of AE products) on agroecological production and in particular on the producer families supported by the program (market access, better income, production diversification, availability of AE products, etc.).
 - The partners expect the evaluation to identify the remaining obstacles to the consumption of healthy products from local family farms.
 - Finally, the external evaluation should highlight recommendations for improving the effectiveness and sustainability of the awareness-raising techniques and marketing support strategies.

Justification of these assessment questions:

Finally, the project acts downstream in the food system, to increase consumption in both urban and rural areas of healthy, local products derived from agroecology, and giving value to the work of farmers.

Arusha is an agricultural region, with over 80% of its inhabitants involved in agricultural and livestock production. However, malnutrition remains endemic and higher than in the rest of the country. The diet of family farms depends mainly on their production, with maize predominating in the diet, and a lack of knowledge about nutrition.

The city of Arusha is undergoing significant demographic growth, raising the challenge of feeding its population. However, local marketing channels are not optimally organized, with intermediaries wielding considerable power, and significant losses linked to food storage and transport. The foodstuffs sold on markets and consumed by the population are of poor sanitary quality (biological contamination and residues of phytosanitary products), and products from local, healthy, sustainable agriculture are not promoted.

In this context, the partners are working on shortening marketing channels, to bring farmers closer to promising outlets: participatory guarantee system, organization of farmers' markets, linking farmers with vendors/restaurants.

On the other hand, the partners are deploying training and awareness-raising initiatives on healthy eating: with restaurant-owners and fruit and vegetable vendors, through the local media, or by directly targeting end consumers (poster campaigns). The aim is not only to improve hygiene practices when handling foodstuffs, but also to improve knowledge of where food comes from and the conditions under which it is produced.

In order to address the assessment questions presented here, the partners expect the external evaluation to be based on factual data, as well as on more qualitative data linked to the feelings of the stakeholders and beneficiaries.

- ⇒ With regard to the three areas of assessment identified, **the external evaluation should identify lessons and recommendations to guide and prioritize actions** for the next phases of the project.



2.3. Expected methodology.

2.3.1. *General approach:*

CARI, IDP and their partners wish that the consultants propose a participatory and inclusive approach.

To address the evaluation questions presented above, the partners expect the external evaluation to be based on factual data as well as on more qualitative data, linked to the feelings of the players and beneficiaries.

Stakeholders to consult:

Partners and donors of the project (face-to-face meetings, telephone/videoconference meetings, e-mail surveys, etc.):

- CARI, as coordinator of the AFD project: program director, project officer, board members.
- Island of Peace, MVIWAARUSHA and RECODA: directors, program and project officers, support team members.
- Donors: referent persons in AFD, DGD, MIROVA foundation and Occitanie region.

Beneficiaries of the project (face-to-face meetings, focus groups):

- Sample of farmers members of the groups supported by the project (including lead farmers, champions, and environmental champions).
- Local government representatives, including the focal point from the region, and extension officers.
- Sample of restaurants owner, food sellers, journalists, supported by the project.
- Members of SHIWAKUTA.

Other stakeholders and partners (face-to-face meetings, telephone/videoconference meetings, e-mail surveys, etc.):

- Associated NGOs: RIKOLTO, TRIAS, Just dig it.
- Members from ACAF and Arusha Sustainable food system platform.
- Experts, scientists and referent persons from ministries.

Mission and field visits to plan:

The consultant team will have to travel to Arusha to meet project partners, beneficiaries, and other stakeholders. Field visits to a sample of intervention villages should be planned (4 to 5 villages).

2.3.2. *Coordination meetings and deliverables*

Inception meetings:

An initial scoping meeting will be held between CARI, IDP and the team of consultants (including at least the head of mission) as soon as the team has been selected (face-to-face or videoconference meeting).

Following this meeting, the consultants will prepare **a scoping note** setting out the objectives, the questions to be asked, the methodology, the stakeholders to be met, the approach and tools, and the timetable for the evaluation, based on the initial reading of the documents and the first scoping meeting. This scoping note will be presented and discussed at a **second scoping meeting** with the members of the project's steering committee (by videoconference).



Mission and field visits

The mission to Arusha region will be coordinated through:

- Before the mission: a scoping meeting with representatives of each of the 4 partners to validate a detailed roadmap for the mission.
- After the mission: a debriefing meeting with representatives of the 4 partners to present the results with transparency and ensure that the evaluator's perceptions and analyses arising from the field visits are fed by insights provided by the team in charge of program implementation.
- Deliverable: a mission report presenting the results.

Final report and synthesis:

At the end of the evaluation process, the consultants will provide an evaluation report based on an analysis of the documentation provided on the project, supplemented by the results of the interviews and surveys of the stakeholders, carried out remotely and face-to-face. The report will incorporate the conclusions and recommendations of the external evaluation. A first version of this final report will be sent to the CARI and the project's partners for review, then discussed with the consultants at a meeting (face-to-face or by videoconference).

The consultants will complete their final evaluation report, considering the feedback from the partners, and will also write a summary of the final report no longer than ten pages.

Restitution meeting:

A presentation of the final report should be organized for the project partners and in the presence of the AFD. At least one of the consultants will be responsible for presenting the results of the external evaluation.

Subsequently, CARI, IDP and their partners will make sure that the evaluation's conclusions are communicated to the beneficiaries of the project (at least to the people who took part in the surveys and interviews).

2.3.3. Roles and responsibilities of the partners in the evaluation

The CARI (demanding organization) will be responsible for overseeing closely the external evaluation and will liaise with the partners.

- CARI and IDP will be involved throughout the evaluation process and will support the planning and preparation of the various phases of the evaluation.
- Steering committee members (directors and project managers from IDP, MVIWAARUSHA and RECODA) will be resource persons during the evaluation process. They will be involved in the scoping and finalization phase: feedbacks and validation of the deliverables.
- The project officers from partners' organizations will organize the field visits and accompany the consultants to the villages.



3. Consultant recruitment

Bearing in mind the above elements, the consultants are asked to include in their tender for services detailed proposals regarding the methodology they propose (stages of the evaluation, stakeholders consulted, meetings and feedback, methodology for gathering and analyzing information, documents produced, links with the CARI and partners).

In their proposal for services, the consultant(s) must also indicate how the number of working days will be allocated to the different phases of the evaluation (and possibly between each consultant if a team is proposed).

If a team of consultants is proposed, they should indicate their previous experience of working together, how they will coordinate their work on the evaluation, and how they will complement each other in terms of the work required.

3.1. Requirements

3.1.1. Required expertise

The evaluation will be carried out by a consultant or a team of consultants (possibly North-South), one of whom will be head of mission (the proposals will specify which consultant), with the following skills and experience:

- Significant experience in external evaluation
- Experience in project management
- Knowledge of NGOs, associations
- Knowledge of agroecology
- Knowledge of AFD procedures
- Knowledge of Tanzanian context / Experience in East Africa

3.1.2. Financial proposal

Applicants must submit a detailed financial proposal (including all taxes) considering the following elements:

- The overall budget for the evaluation is set at €24,000 including VAT.
- The maximum daily fee is set at €500 including VAT.
- The budget includes the costs associated with the consultants' missions (travel, per diems, visa, accommodation and communication costs).
- The budget also includes interpretation costs (Swahili) if the consultant team doesn't include a person fluent in Swahili.
- A mission is planned to the implementation area of the project.
- The financial proposal must specify the number of days worked at the various stages of the evaluation.

3.2. Agenda for the evaluation

The technical proposal must include a timetable that considers the following agenda items:

Scoping/Inception phase: June 2024

- Submission of documents required for the evaluation.
- Presentation of the project, partners, and expectations in relation to the evaluation.
- Validation of the assessment questions.
- Presentation of the methodology, tools, and adjustments.
- Identification of stakeholders for the survey.

Deliverable: Inception report setting out the methodology

Evaluation phase: July-September 2024

- Interviews
- Mission in the implementation area (in September to consider the results of the cropping season of 2024)
- Analysis of the data

Deliverables: mission reports, interview reports, etc.

Drafting, correction, restitution: October - November 2024

- Drafting of the provisional report and proofreading by CARI and the partners
- Finalization of the report and drafting of the synthesis
- Final report presented to the project partners during a steering committee meeting attended by AFD.

Final deliverables: final report, summary

3.3. Technical and methodological proposal

Technical and financial proposals must be sent by 17 March 2024 at the latest by e-mail to Ms. Manon Albagnac (Project officer), CARI: sahel@cariassociation.org

The technical and methodological proposal must include the following elements:

- Understanding of the terms of reference (2 pages maximum)
- Methodology including provisional timetable (8 pages maximum)
- A detailed financial proposal not exceeding €24,000 including VAT
- Presentation, references, and CV of each consultant
- Bank details and business registration number

3.4. Selection criteria

The technical proposals will be evaluated on the basis of their compliance with the terms of reference and the following criteria:

- Understanding of the terms of reference: 20 points
- Methodology (relevance and justification): 40 points
- Qualifications and experience: 40 points



Each compliant proposal will be awarded a technical score (Ts). A proposal will be rejected at this stage if it fails to address significant aspects of the terms of reference or fails to achieve the minimum technical score of 65 out of 100 points.

Financial proposals will be evaluated as follows:

The lowest financial proposal (Fme) will receive a financial score (Fs) of 100 points. The financial scores (Fs) of the other financial proposals will be calculated as follows:

$$Sf = 100 \times Fme/F$$

Sf being the financial score, Fme the lowest proposal and F the global budget of the proposal in question.

The proposals will then be ranked according to their combined technical and financial scores after introducing weightings (T = 0.8 being the weighting attributed to the Technical Proposal and P = 0.2 the weighting attributed to the Financial Proposal), according to the formula:

$$S = St \times T + Sf \times P$$

4. Appendix

Partners' website:

CARI: <https://www.cariassociation.org/fr/>

IDP: <https://www.ilesdepaix.org/>

RECODA: <https://recoda.or.tz/>

MVIWAARUSHA: <https://www.mviwaarusha.or.tz/>

Presentation video: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=93yG4PXU2ak>

Online file:

<https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1hazebxV3m1XFf9jaA8OoARHwFn7lNRTd?usp=sharing>

Includes:

- ➔ Project document (AFD)
- ➔ Presentation flyer

